

## Wittgenstein's View of What Understanding Is and Examining McDowell's Reading of It

Abolfazl Sabramiz\*

DOI: 10.22096/EK.2022.531927.1374

[Received Date: 29/11/2020 Acceptance Date: 20/05/2021]

### Abstract

Understanding is not matter of mind in Wittgenstein view. But this position is met with a protest called “scientific objection” as if the philosopher is simply ruling out something that neurologist or psychologist could discover. In this article we show that Wittgenstein did not resent the position of science and only denies the claim that science can provide an a priori account of understanding. In the general reading of Wittgenstein's view, understanding is seen as an ability. But this is at odds with the fact that understanding happens in an instant, and that is why we explained in this article the position of understanding is like the “beginning of ability” which considers both understanding in relation to ability and its occurrence. However, the denial of the subjectivity of understanding attributes an anti-realist stance on understanding to Wittgenstein. Therefore, with the help of McDowell's interpretation of Wittgenstein, we try to show that Wittgenstein considers the linguistic understanding as a certain state of mind in the language game. McDowell's interpretation, however, contradicts some of Wittgenstein's points, especially in Zettel.

**Keywords:** Wittgenstein; McDowell; Understanding; Ability; State of Mind.

---

\* Ph.D of Philosophy, ACECR Institute for Humanities and Social Studies (IHSS), Tehran, Iran.  
Email: sabramiz@gmail.com



## Bibliography

### A) Books & Articles

- Baker, G. P., & Hacker, P. M. S. (1983/ 2005). *Wittgenstein: Understanding and meaning: Volume 1 of an analytical commentary on the philosophical investigations, part I: Essays* (Vol. 1), Blackwell Publishing, (1983/2005).
- Brandt, S. "How not to read Philosophical Investigations: McDowell and Goldfarb on Wittgenstein on understanding." *Philosophical Investigations* 37. no.4 (2014): 289-311.
- Dummett, M. A. E. *Origins of Analytic Philosophy*, Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1993.
- Goldfarb, W. "Wittgenstein on Understanding." *Midwest studies in philosophy* 17. no. 1 (1992): 109-122.
- Grilling, E.S. *Wittgenstein*. Translated by Abolfazl Haghiri. Tehran: Basirat, 2009. [In Persian]
- Kenny, Anthony. *The Architecture of Language and Mind in Wittgenstein's Philosophy*. Translated by Mohammad Reza Asmkhani, Tehran: Phoenix, 2013. [In Persian]
- Longworth, G. "A Plea for Understanding." In *New Waves in Philosophy of Language*, (Ed) Sarah Sawyer. pp. 138-164. London: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010.
- McDowell, J. "Are meaning, understanding, etc., definite states?" In *The engaged intellect: Philosophical essays*, pp. 79-94. NJ: Harvard University Press, 2009.
- McGinn, Mary. *Wittgenstein and Philosophical Research*. Translated by Iraj Qanuni, Tehran: Nashr-e Ney, 2003. [In Persian]
- Pettit, D. "Why Knowledge is Unnecessary for Understanding Language." In *Mind* 111. no. 443 (2002): 519-550.
- Smith, B. C. "Speech Sounds and the Direct Meeting of Minds." in *New Philosophical Essays*, Matthew Nudds & Casey O'Callaghan (eds.), 183-210, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- Wittgenstein, L. *Philosophical Grammar: Part I, the Proposition, and Its Sense, Part II, On Logic and Mathematics*. Blackwell: Oxford University Press, 1974.
- Wittgenstein, L. *Philosophical Investigations*. NY: John Wiley & Sons, 1953/2009.

Wittgenstein, L. *Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1978.

Wittgenstein, L., & F. Waismann. *The Voices of Wittgenstein: The Vienna Circle*. edited by Gordon Baker. translated by Baker et al, 2003.

Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Blue and Brown Books*. Translated by Iraj Qanuni. Tehran: Ney, 2006. [In Persian]

Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Blue Books*. Translated by Malik Hosseini. Tehran: Hermes, 2014. [In Persian]

Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Philosophical Research*. Translated by Fereydoun Fatemi. Tehran: Markaz Publishing, 2002. [In Persian]

Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Sheets*. Translated by Malik Hosseini. Tehran: Hermes, 2005. [In Persian]

**B) Websites**

Choi, S. (2012). "Disposition" in *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

<https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/dispositions/>

Maier, J. (2014). Abilities. *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Online at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/abilities/>.