

Re-reading the views of Contemporary Commentators on Hegel's Philosophy of Religion

*Mohammad Kheyri**

DOI: 10.22096/ek.2024.2008465.1522

Received Date: 04/08/2023 - Accepted Date: 29/01/2024

Abstract

Hegel explicitly declared that the subject of philosophy is the same as that of religion, namely, God. This raises a fundamental question: if the subject of philosophy is religion, does Hegel believe in the superiority of religion over philosophy in a pre-Kantian manner and understand philosophy within the framework of Christian understanding, or vice versa? Each commentator has provided a different answer to this question, and the issue of this article arises from these differing opinions. Reflecting on this issue prevents us from methodological confusion when reading Hegel's religious views due to these interpretations. Therefore, we strive to categorize the interpretations while examining the reasons for the differences in the commentators' views. Subsequently, we analyze them, highlight their similarities and differences, and explain the methodology of each. Finally, we endeavor to demonstrate the necessity of preserving the plurality of interpretive paradigms through their various possibilities and rationalities. In this way, we explain that seeking reconciliation between interpretations is fundamentally unnecessary. Each interpretation leads to a new encounter and a novel answer to problems, and any judgment to prefer one interpretation over another is inherently based on criteria and presuppositions that have no intrinsic preference over one another.

Key words: Hegelian philosophy of religion; metaphysical interpretation; non-metaphysical interpretation; mystical interpretation.

* Assistant Professor, Department of Philosophy, Mofid University, Qom, Iran.
Email: m.khairi@yahoo.com



Bibliography

- Beiser, Frederick. "Hegel, A Non-Metaphysician? A Polemic Review of H T Engelhardt and Terry Pinkard (eds), *Hegel Reconsidered*." *Bulletin of the Hegel Society of Great Britain* 16 (1995): 1-13. doi:10.1017/S0263523200005504.
- Beiser, Frederick. *Hegel*. New York and London: Routledge, 2005.
- Desmond, William. *Beyond Hegel and dialectic: Speculation, cult, and comedy*. New York: State University of New York Press, 1992.
- Desmond, William. *Hegel's God: A Counterfeit Double?*. Burlington: Ashgate, 2003.
- Desmond, William. *Is There a Sabbath for Thought? Between Religion and Philosophy*. New York: Fordham University Press, 2005.
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Phenomenology of Spirit*. Translated by A. V. New York: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Hodgson, Peter c. "Hegel's Philosophy of Religion." In *The Cambridge Companion to Hegel and Nineteenth-Century Philosophy*, edited by Frederick C Beiser, 230-252. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Hodgson, Peter C. *Hegel and Christian Theology: A Reading of the Lectures on the Philosophy of Religion*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- Jaeschke, Walter. "Philosophy of Religion after the Death of God." In *Philosophy and Religion in German Idealism*, edited by William Desmond, Ernst-Otto Onnasch, and Paul Cruysberghs, 1-19. New York: Springer Science & Business Media, 2005.
- Jaeschke, Walter. *Reason in Religion: The Foundations of Hegel's Philosophy of Religion*. Translated by J. Michael Stewart, and Peter C. Hodgson. California: University of California Press, 1990.
- Lewis, Thomas A. "Beyond the Totalitarian: Ethics and the Philosophy of Religion in Recent Hegel Scholarship." *Religion Compass* 2, (July 2008): 556-574. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-8171.2008.00077.x>.
- Magee, Glenn Alexander. "Hegel and Mysticism." In *The Cambridge Companion to Hegel and Nineteenth-Century Philosophy*, edited by Frederick C Beiser, 253-280. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Magee, Glenn Alexander. *Hegel and the Hermetic Tradition*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 2001.

O'Regan, Cyril. *The Heterodox Hegel*. New York: State University of New York Press, 1994.

Pinkard, Terry. "What is the non-metaphysical reading of Hegel? A reply to Frederick Beiser." *Hegel Bulletin* 17, no. 2 (1996): 13-20. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0263523200005711>.

Pinkard, Terry. *Hegel: A Biography*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000.

Rockmore, Tom. "Hegel on Reason, Faith and Knowledge." In *Philosophy and Religion in German Idealism*, edited by William Desmond, Ernst-Otto Onnasch, & Paul Cruysberghs, 125-137. New York: Springer Science & Business Media, 2005.

Williams, Robert R. *Tragedy, recognition, and the death of God: Studies in Hegel and Nietzsche*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.