

## "God as a supra-moral agent: Why are divine actions, commands, and prohibitions not subject to human moral/rational rules and laws?"

*Mirsaeid Mousavi Karimi\**

DOI: 10.22096/ek.2025.2070028.1598

Received Date: 25/04/2025 - Accepted Date: 29/08/2025

### Abstract

In this article, the view of "God as a moral agent" is opposed, and the view of "God as a supra-moral/supra-rational agent" is defended. "Supra-moral/supra-rational" does not mean that human reason is fundamentally incapable of understanding divine actions, revelatory propositions, and religious texts, nor that human moral/rational rules are in conflict with them. Rather, it means that one cannot claim that within the frameworks of human reason, these have been understood "completely and exactly," or that we have the right to measure them by the criterion of human reason and morality and reject them in opposition. The structure of the article is as follows: after examining several preliminary points, an argument in favor of the view of God as a moral agent is formulated and critiqued; then, by explaining the view of God as a supra-moral/supra-rational agent, four arguments titled "the relationship of the conscious intelligent robot with the human as its maker," "the argument from pessimistic meta-induction," "Darwinian evolution and divine commandments," and "greater explanatory advantages compared to rival theories" are formulated and presented to support it. Finally, several objections to the proposed approach are raised and answered.

**Key Words:** Divine Actions; Divine Commandments; Moral Agent; Supra-Moral; Supra-Rational.

---

\* Professor, Department of Philosophy, Mofid University, Qom, Iran.  
Email: msaeid\_karimi@yahoo.com



### Bibliography

- Abductive Inference: Computation, Philosophy, Technology*. Edited by Josephson, John R, and Susan G Josephson. Cambridge: CUP, 2003.
- Adams, Robert M. *Finite and Infinite Goods*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Adams, Robert M. *The Virtue of Faith and Other Essays in Philosophical Theology*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1987.
- al-Ash‘arī, Abū al-Ḥasan. *al-Luma‘ fī al-Radd ‘alā Ahl al-Zaygh wa al-Bid‘a*. Beirut: Catholic Press, 1952. [In Arabic]
- Alexander, Larry and Michael Moore. "Deontological Ethics." in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edited by Edward N. Zalta. Winter 2021 Edition. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2021/entries/ethics-deontological/>
- al-Mu‘tazilī, Qādī ‘Abd al-Jabbār. *al-Mughni fī Abwāb al-Tawḥīd wa al-‘Adl*. Cairo: Egyptian National Library Press, 1962.
- Asimov, Isaac. "Runaround." in *I, Robot (The Isaac Asimov Collection edition)*. New York City: Doubleday, 1950.
- Augustine of Hippo. *The City of God against the Pagans*. Edited by R. W. Dyson. Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- Boyd, Richard. "On the Current Status of Scientific Realism." *Erkenntnis* 19 (1983): 45-90, reprinted in *The Philosophy of Science*, Edited by By R. Boyd, P. Gasper, and J. D. Trout, 195-222. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1999.
- Bradie, Michael and William Harms. "Evolutionary Epistemology." *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edited by Edward N. Zalta & Uri Nodelman. Spring 2023 Edition. URL = [<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2023/entries/epistemology-evolutionary/>](https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2023/entries/epistemology-evolutionary/).
- Campbell, Donald T. "Evolutionary Epistemology." In *The Philosophy of Karl Popper*, Vol. I, Eedited by Paul A. Schlipp, 413-459. Illinois: La Salle, 1974.
- Douven, Igor. "Abduction." *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edited by Edward N. Zalta. Summer 2021 Edition. URL = [<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2021/entries/abduction/>](https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2021/entries/abduction/).
- Driver, Julia. "The History of Utilitarianism." In *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edited by Edward N. Zalta. Winter 2014 Edition. Available at:

- <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2014/entries/utilitarianism-history/>
- Duns Scotus, John. *Selected Writings on Ethics*. "Do all the precepts of the Decalogue belong to the natural law?." Oxford University Press, 2017. Ordinatio III, D. 37. ISBN 978-0-19-967341-4.
- E'temād al-Eslāmī Bakhtiyārī, Moḥammad-Mahdī. "An Aalysis of Epistemological Justification of Inference to the Best Explanation." PhD diss., Sharif University of Technology, Faculty of Philosophy of Science, 2016. [In Persian]
- Fanā'ī, Abū al-Qāsim. "God as a Moral Agent (1)." *Existence and Knowledge* 17, no. 1 (Spring–Summer 2022): 41–70. [In Persian]
- Fanā'ī, Abū al-Qāsim. "God as a Moral Agent (2)." *Existence and Knowledge* 18, no. 2 (Fall–Winter 2022): 7–30. [In Persian]
- Feynman, Richard. *The Character of Physical Law*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1967.
- French, Steven and Tomasz Bigaj. "Identity and Individuality in Quantum Theory" *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edied by Edward N. Zalta & Uri Nodelman. Spring 2024 Edition. URL = <<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2024/entries/qt-idind/>>.
- Gontier, Nathalie. (2025) "Evolutionary Epistemology." *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, URL = <https://iep.utm.edu/evo-epis/>
- Harman, Gilbert. "The Inference to the Best Explanation." *Philosophical Review* 74 (1965): 88–95.
- Ibn 'Arabī, Muḥyī al-Dīn. *Fuṣūṣ al-Ḥikam*. Commentary by Abū al-'Alā 'Afīfī. Tehran: Al-Zahrā Publications, 1991. [In Arabic]
- Kant, Immanuel. *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*. Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- Khomeynī, Rūḥallāh. *Tahrīr al-Wasīla*. Vol. 2. "Khātima – Ahkām-e Shar'ī dar Karāt-e Dīgar." Tehran: Institute for Compilation and Publication of Imam Khomeini's Works, 2013. Published on Imam Khomeini Portal. [In Persian]
- Kierkegaard, Soren. *Fear and Trembling-Repetition: Kierkegaard's Writings*. Vol. 6. Princeton University Press, 1983.
- Leibniz, G. W. *Political Writings*. Second edition. Translated and Edited by Patrick Riley. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Lewis, Peter J. "Why the Pessimistic Induction is a Fallacy." *Synthese* 129 (2001): 371-380.

- Majlisī, Moḥammad-Bāqir. *Bihār al-Anwār al-Jāmi‘a li-Durar Akhbār al-A‘imma al-Aṭhār*. Vol. 66. Edited by Moḥammad-Bāqir Behbūdī. Qom: Dār al-Kutub al-Islāmiyya, 1983. [In Arabic]
- Malekīān, Moṣṭafā. “Āshtī-Pazīrī yā Nā-Pazīrī-ye ‘Aqlāniyat va Ma‘naviyat.” Lecture at Soroush-e Molānā Institute, February 19, 2017. Published on 3danet.ir. . <https://3danet.ir/sahebi-malekian>. [In Persian]
- Malekīān, Moṣṭafā. “Tasavvorāt-e Mokhtalef az Khudā.” YouTube video. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gYz1IVSY4Gg>. [In Persian]
- Millstein, Roberta L. (2024) "Evolution", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edited by Edward N. Zalta & Uri Nodelman. Spring 2024 Edition. URL = <<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2024/entries/evolution/>>.
- Moṭāhharī, Mortazā. *Majmū‘eh-ye Āthār*. Vol. 8 (Philosophy of Ibn Sīnā, Theology Lessons from al-Shifā‘). Tehran: Sadra Publications, 2010. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid, and Seyyed Moḥammad-Mahdī E‘temād al-Eslāmī. “Ertebāt-e Mazīyyat-hā-ye Tabyīngar bā Yekdīgar va Maḥdūdiyat-e Irād-e Hungerford.” *Zehn* 16, no. 63 (Fall 2015): 131–164. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid, and Seyyed Moḥammad-Mahdī E‘temād al-Eslāmī. “Inference to the Best Explanation and “the Bad Lot Objection.”” *Existence and Knowledge* 2, no. 2 (2015): 111–131. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid, and Seyyed Moḥammad-Mahdī E‘temād al-Eslāmī. “Vakāvi-ye Malāk-hā-ye Eḥtemālātī dar Estentāj-e Behtarīn Tabyīn.” *Research in Logics* 8, no. 2 (Fall–Winter 2017): 25–48. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid, and Seyyed Moḥammad-Mahdī E‘temād al-Eslāmī. “Deficiency of Probabilistic Approach for Settling Voltaire’s Objection.” *Methodology of Social Sciences and Humanities (MSSH)* 25, no. 98 (Spring 2019): 139–150. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid. “Naqdī bar Didgāh-e Moṣṭafā Malekīān dar Mored-e Ta‘abbod dar Dīn.” Published on 3danet.ir (2021). <https://3danet.ir/religious-belief-modern-rationality/> [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid. “Scientific Realism and the Underdetermination Argument.” *Existence and Knowledge* 7, no. 1 (Spring–Summer 2020): 7–46. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid. “Scientific Realism, Structural Realism, and the

- Pessimistic Meta-Induction Argument." *Philosophy of Science* 12, no. 1 (Spring–Summer 2022): 153–179. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid. "The Pessimistic Meta-Induction Argument and Scientific Realism: The Non-Referential Approaches." *Existence and Knowledge* 17, no. 1 (Spring–Summer 2022): 7-39. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid. "The Pessimistic Meta-Induction Argument and Scientific Realism: The Referential Approaches." *Metaphysics* 14, no. 2 (Fall–Winter 2022): 57–84. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeid. *Dārāmadī bar Falsafeh-ye Zabān va Zabān-e Dīn*. Qom: Mofid University Press, 2023. [In Persian]
- Naturalism Defeated?: Essays on Plantinga's Evolutionary Argument Against Naturalism*. Edited by James K. Beilby. Cornell University Press, 2002.
- Okasha, Samir. *A Very Short Introduction: Philosophy of Biology*. Oxford: OUP, 2019.
- Plantinga, Alvin & Michael Tooley. *Knowledge of God*. Blackwell Publishing, 2008.
- Plantinga, Alvin. *Warrant and Proper Function*. Oxford University Press Inc, 1993.
- Plantinga, Alvin. *Warranted Christian Belief*. Oxford University Press Inc, 2000.
- Psillos, Stathis. *Scientific Realism: How Science Tracks Truth*. London: Routledge, 1999.
- Putnam, H. *Meaning and the Moral Sciences*. Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1978.
- Rescher, N. *G. W. Leibniz's Monadology*. Psychology Press, 1992.
- Schupbach, J.N. "Is the Bad Lot Objection Just Misguided?." *Erkenntnis* 79 (2014): 55-64.
- Sinnott-Armstrong, Walter. "Consequentialism." *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edited by Edward N. Zalta. Fall 2021 Edition. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2021/entries/consequentialism>.
- Ṭabāṭabā'ī, Moḥammad-Ḥosayn. *al-Mīzān fī Tafsīr al-Qur'ān*. Vols. 13–14. Beirut: Al-'Ilmī Publishing Institute, 1996. [In Arabic]
- Thomson, Judith Jarvis. "The Trolley Problem." in *Deontology*, edited by Stephen Darwall Malden, 139-162. MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2003.
- Van Fraassen, B.C. *Laws and Symmetry*. New York: OUP, 1989.

Weston, Thomas. "Approximate Truth and Scientific Realism." *Philosophy of Science* 59, (Number 1992): 53-74.

Weston, Thomas. "Approximate truth." *Journal of Philosophical Logic* 16 (1987): 203-22.

William of Ockham. *Ockham on the Virtues*, Edited and Translated by Rega Wood. West Lafayette: Purdue University Press, 1997.

Xenophanes of Colophon. *Fragments, A Text and Translation with a Commentary*, Edited by J.H. Lesher. Toronto: University of Toronto Press Incorporated 1992.