

## A Critique of Contemporary Analytic Philosophy's Approach to Mythical Objects

*Davood Hosseini\**

*Mohammad Hadi Soleimani\*\**

DOI: 10.22096/ek.2025.2048757.1581

Received Date: 23/12/2024 - Accepted Date: 05/05/2025

### Abstract

Inquiry into mythical objects has appeared in the contemporary analytical tradition through issues such as Geach's identity paradox, the ontology of fictional objects, and neo-Meinongianism. Despite the different approaches to these issues, there is agreement that mythical objects are like fictional objects, metaphysically, semantically, and ontologically. The only difference is epistemological which is not significant, that is to say, these differences have no force in their logical, semantic, and metaphysical features. Non-analytic mythological research, however, does not support these conclusions. This significant conflict between analytic and non-analytic traditions regarding myth, relates to the methodology of analytic philosophy on psychological and sociological issues. Analytic philosophers do not have adequate tools to deal with their own mythology alongside other mythologies, as in the case of physics or chemistry. Thus, in approaching mythology, it is inevitable to respect non-analytic mythological investigations, albeit with the correction of some of their raw and imprecise views by mature analytic tools.

**Keywords:** Mythology; Mythical Object; Fictional Object; Analytic Philosophy; Methodology.

---

\* Associate Professor, Faculty of Humanities, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran.  
(Corresponding Author)

Email: davood.hosseini.c@gmail.com

\*\* PhD in Philosophy, Faculty of Humanities, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran.

Email: mhsoleimani@modares.ac.ir



### Bibliography

- Ackerman, Robert. *Myth and Ritual School*. London: Routledge, 2009.
- Berto, Francesco, and Matteo Plebani. *Ontology and Metaontology. A Contemporary Guide*. New York: Blumsbury, 2015.
- Berto, Francesco. *Existence as a Real Property: The Ontology of Meinongianism*. Dordrecht: Springer, 2013.
- Bishop, Paul. "From the archaic into the aesthetic: myth and literature in the "Orphic" Goethe." In *Myth, Literature and Unconscious*, Edited by Leon Burnett, Sanja Bahun, and Roderick Main, 189-209. London: Karnac Books Ltd, 2013.
- Bouchard, Gérard. *Social Myths and Collective Imaginaries*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2017.
- Braun, David. "Wondering about Witches." In *Fictional Objects*, Edited by Stuart Brock and Anthony Everett. Oxford: Oxford Scholarship Online, 2015.
- Brock, Stuart and Anthony Everett. "Introduction." In *Fictional Objects*, Edited by Stuart Brock and Anthony Everett. Oxford: Oxford Scholarship Online, 2015.
- Burge, Tylor. *Truth, Thought, Reason. Essays on Frege*. Oxford: Clarendon, 2005.
- Clarke, Simon. *The Foundations of Structuralism. A Critique of Levi-Strauss and the Structuralist Movement*. Sussex: Harvester, 1981.
- Doty, William G. "Myth and Postmodernist Philosophy." In *Thinking Through Myths. Philosophical Perspectives*, Edited by Kevin Schilbrack, 142-157. London: Routledge, 2002.
- Doty, William G. *Mythography. The Study of Myths and Rituals*. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2000.
- Ellwood, Robert. *The Politics of Myth*. New York: State University of New York Press, 1999.
- Everett, Anthony. *The Non-Existence*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Geach, Peter. *Logic Matters*. Berkeley: Basil Blackwell, 1972.
- Hatab, Lawrence J. *Myth and Philosophy*. Illinois: Open Court, 1990.
- Jacquette, Dale. *Alexius Meinong, the Shepherd of Non-Being*. Dordrecht: Springer, 2015.

- Jeshion, Robin. "Two Dogmas of Russellianism." In *Empty Representations*, Edited by Manuel García-Carpintero and Genoveva Martí, 67-90. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Kirk, G. S. *Myth. Its Meaning and Functions in Ancient and Other Cultures*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970.
- Kripke, Saul A. *Philosophical Troubles*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Levi-Strauss, Claude. *Myth and Meaning*. London: Routledge, 1978.
- Lycan, William G. "A Reconsidered Defence of Haecceitism Regarding Fictional Individuals." In *Fictional Objects*, Edited by Stuart Brock and Anthony Everett. Oxford: Oxford Scholarship Online, 2015.
- Merkur, Dan. *Psychoanalytic Approaches to Myth*. London: Routledge, 2004.
- Muller, Max. "On the Migration of Fables." In *The Essential Max Muller on Language, Mythology, and Religion*, Edited by Jon R. Stone, 123-144. London: Palgrave, 2002.
- Muller, Max. "On the Philosophy of Mythology." In *The Essential Max Muller on Language, Mythology, and Religion*, Edited by Jon R. Stone, 145-166. London: Palgrave, 2002.
- Parsons, Trence. *Nonexistent Objects*. Westford: Yale University Press, 1980.
- Routley, Richard. *Exploring Meinong's Jungle and Beyond*. Digital Commons@McMaster, 1980.
- Salmon, Nathan. "The Philosopher's Stone and Other Mythical Objects." In *Fictional Objects*, Edited by Stuart Brock and Anthony Everett. Oxford: Oxford Scholarship Online, 2015.
- Segal, Robert A. "Freudian and Jungian Approaches to Myth: The Similarities." In *Myth, Literature and Unconscious*, Edited by Leon Burnett, Sanja Bahun, and Roderick Main, 101-119. London: Karnac Books Ltd, 2013.
- Segal, Robert A. "Myth as Primitive Philosophy: the case of E.B. Tylor." In *Thinking Trough Myths. Philosophical Perspectives*, Edited by Kevin Schilbrack, 18-45. London: Routledge, 2002.
- Segal, Robert A. *Myth. A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.
- Sluga, Hans. *Gottlob Frege*. London: Routledge, 1980.
- Soleimani, Mohammad Hadi & Davood Hosseini. "Extending Zalta's Logic to Abstract Ordinary Objects." *Logical Investigations* 14, no. 2 (2024):

85-117. [https://logicalstudy.ihcs.ac.ir/article\\_9370.html](https://logicalstudy.ihcs.ac.ir/article_9370.html).

Spitzer, Anais N. *Derrida, Myth and the Impossibility of Philosophy*. Chennai: Continuum, 2011.

Voltolini, Alberto. *How Ficta Follow Fiction*. Dordrecht: Springer, 2006.

Walker, Janet A. "The confrontation with the Anima in Akinari Ueda's Story "Jasei no in" ("A serpent's lust", 1776)." In *Myth, Literature and Unconscious*, Edited by Leon Burnett, Sanja Bahun, and Roderick Main, 149-166. London: Karnac Books Ltd, 2013.

Walker, Steven F. "Apocalypse, Transformation, and Scapegoating: Moving Myth into the Twenty-first Century." In *Myth, Literature and Unconscious*, Edited by Leon Burnett, Sanja Bahun, and Roderick Main, 3-16. London: Karnac Books Ltd, 2013.

Zalta, Edward. *Intensional Logic & the Metaphysics of Intentionality*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1988.